

# South Devon and Dartmoor Procurement Partnership



## Executive Summary

### Temporary Worker Provision

2009-2012<sup>1</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> Plus optional 1 year extension taking the contract to 2013



## **Table of Contents**

<b>1.</b>	<b>Executive Summary</b>	<b>Page</b>	<b>3 - 5</b>
<b>2.</b>	<b>Recommendation – Contract Award</b>	<b>Page</b>	<b>5</b>
<b>3.</b>	<b>Contract Considerations</b>	<b>Page</b>	<b>5 - 6</b>
<b>4.</b>	<b>Potential Savings</b>	<b>Page</b>	<b>6 - 10</b>
<b>5.</b>	<b>Evaluation Process</b>	<b>Page</b>	<b>10 - 12</b>
<b>6.</b>	<b>Evaluation Results</b>	<b>Page</b>	<b>12 - 13</b>
<b>7.</b>	<b>Benefits to the Councils</b>	<b>Page</b>	<b>12 - 13</b>
<b>8.</b>	<b>Ordering</b>	<b>Page</b>	<b>13</b>
<b>9.</b>	<b>General Comments about Concept</b>	<b>Page</b>	<b>14 - 15</b>
<b>10.</b>	<b>Summary Conclusion &amp; Recommendation</b>	<b>Page</b>	<b>15</b>

Appendix A: List of suppliers sent documentation

Appendix B: Summary of PQQ Scores

Appendix C: Summary of ITT Scores

Appendix D: Summary Pricing

Approval

## 1. Executive Summary

- 1.1 The Councils of the South Devon and Dartmoor Procurement Partnership (Teignbridge, South Hams and West Devon) currently contract with over seventeen different suppliers for the provision of temporary workers covering Administration, Operational and Specialist temporary worker agency staff. The use of agency staff is critical to the functionality of the Councils and have an overall effect on all of the Councils Corporate priorities to deliver outcomes.
- 1.2 There are currently one year contracts in place for Admin (Pro Personnel) and operational (Jobshop) roles coming to an end in March 2009, there isn't a contract in place for specialist agency staff requirements. The existing one year contracts do not conform to the attainment of best value or to the Councils Contract Procedure rules.
- 1.3 The Councils in the last financial year spent the following on temporary workers:

Council	Office staff	Operations staff	Specialist staff	Totals
South Hams District Council	£155,000	£88,000	£87,000	£330,000
Teignbridge District Council	£97,000	£200,000	£140,000	£437,000
West Devon Borough Council	£11,000	Nil	£85,000	£96,000
Totals	£263,000	£288,000	£312,000	£863,000
% of overall spend	30.48%	33.37%	36.15%	100%

The approximate value of the potential four year contract is **£3,452,000**.

- 1.4 The approximate hours utilised in terms of agency staff in 2007/8 were:

	South hams	Teignbridge	West Devon
<b>Category</b>	<b>Estimated Hours utilised in 2007/8</b>		
<b>Office</b>			
Clerical	8340.5	8129	467
Audio/Word processor			
Data Processor		141	181
Secretary			
Legal Secretary	1570		
Customer Services Assistant/Reception		560	411
<b>Specialist</b>			

EHO	1385		354
Homelessness Prevention		1776	
Building Surveyor		1628	
Architectural Assistant			
Civil Engineering Assistant			619
Benefits Assessor		824	
<b>Consultants</b>	2936	3000 est	1000
<b>Operations</b>			
Refuse Loader		11000	
Road Sweeper		3500	
Recycling loader		9000	
Vehicle Washer		162	
Catering Assistant		572	
<b>TOTALS (Excluding Consultants)</b>	<b>11295.5</b>	<b>37292</b>	<b>2032</b>
			<b>50619.5</b>

1.5 The principal aim of the procurement exercise was to ensure best value Temporary Worker procurement through:

- Consolidating the current arrangements to a framework of suppliers (Up to 8 to cover the regions requirements) or a single supplier to deliver all of the Councils requirements, with named support suppliers
- Using the leverage of the significantly increased purchasing power to reduce prices by using the spend for the 3 Authorities of the South Devon & Dartmoor Procurement Partnership
- Optimising service levels with enabling management information and processes as well as having access to the necessary skills to undertake work on the Councils behalf
- Reducing administrative procedures (invoicing, timesheets, payments)

1.6 Introduction of a collaborative solution for high spend areas is one of the strategic objectives of the South Devon & Dartmoor Procurement Partnership, its purpose being to demonstrate best value across the partnership, create consistency of approach and streamline costs and processes when using Agency Staff within the Councils.

1.7 The provision of temporary workers is a part B service under the Official Journal of the European Union regulations. Therefore the guidelines used for the tender process were in accordance with internal Contract Standing Orders with Teignbridge District Council as the lead Authority on the procurement. A best practice procurement process was used in line with the restricted procedure guidelines to ensure best value and a full audit trail is available through [www.devontenders.gov.uk](http://www.devontenders.gov.uk).

1.8 The contract will be for a period of 3 years with a possible one-year extension that will be subject to annual review and

satisfactory ongoing performance through contract monitoring/management.

- 1.9 This report has been produced by the Corporate Procurement Officer from the partnership to present the recommendations of the procurement process and outline further responsibilities for contract award and seek agreement from the individual management teams to proceed with the stage three of the project (contract award and implementation).

## **2. Recommendation for Contract Award**

- 2.1 The recommendation is to award the full contract as a master vendor arrangement to Concept Staffing to deliver all agency staff requirements across the three Councils for all categories (admin, operational and specialist staff)

- 2.2 That the master vendor appoints a number of SME's to support the delivery of specialist staff primarily and backup for the other two categories to the Council as named 2<sup>nd</sup> tier suppliers with an appropriate service level agreement that dovetails into the master vendor agreement, these being 4Front and Brite (Newton Abbot based companies), South Hams Workforce (Totnes based company) and Tavistaff (West Devon based company). This solution maintains a single method for ordering, invoicing and payment through the master vendor with the benefits of regional support; hence further reduction of transactional costs

- **Concept Staffing were the highest scoring tender overall and the lowest priced tender to specification**
  
- **Support suppliers primary function is to support the specialist staff requirements ensuring a localised approach 4Front, Brite, South Hams Workforce and Tavistaff scored highest in this category and ensure regional delivery**

## **3. Recommendation for Solution Structure**

- 3.1 The structure of the agency staff solution for the region requires further consideration. There are various options summarised as:
- A single approach within each authority to training and contract monitoring
  
  - A regional approach to training and contract monitoring
  
  - A single point of contact in each authority through the HR department for all admin and specialist requirements (Operational requirements to be ordered centrally by the operational teams)

- A single point of ordering for the region such as a recruitment bureau
- Ordering, receipt and Payment of staff processes to be agreed within each authority

3.2 There are further cost savings in a single approach to the implementation and training processes, this would enable shared training, documentation and standard administration approaches. Concept support training and implementation and have a structured implementation process to support the Councils.

#### 4. Potential Savings

4.1 Below is the summary spend per Council in 2007/8 and the approximate cashable savings as a minimum that will be generated per annum over the duration of the contract:

Council	Office Staff Spend 2007/8	5% Saving per year	Operations staff	5% Saving per year	Specialist staff	3% Saving per year	Totals	Total Savings per annum
South Hams District Council	£155,000	£7750	£88,000	£4,400	£87,000	£2,610	£330,000	£14,760
Teignbridge District Council	£97,000	£4,850	£200,000	£10,000	£140,000	£4,200	£437,000	£19,050
West Devon Borough Council	£11,000	£550	Nil	£0	£85,000	£2,550	£96,000	£3,100
Totals	£263,000	£13,150	£288,000	£14,400	£312,000	£9,360	£863,000	£36,910
% of overall spend	30.48%		33.37%		36.15%		100%	

- Concept Staffing were the highest scoring tender overall and the lowest priced tender to specification overall. They were the best value on 4 out of 6 administration roles and 9 out of 10 operational roles the approximate cashable saving on these categories for the contract year on year assuming contract compliance is 5% minimum.
- Specialist savings are more difficult to gage due to lack of information on hourly rates ; however based on the few roles we have highlighted the approximate cashable saving is 3% on current spend and hours
- No temporary to permanent fees will be incurred by the Councils throughout the contract as with previous annual contracts

- Plus an additional rebate equating to approximately £4,000 on spend over £800,000 per annum (0.5%) if contract compliance is adhered to
- Further cashable savings will be possible with weekly management information regarding the agency staff in the authorities. This can be reviewed at management meetings weekly to enable informed decisions and challenge the use of agency staff
- Non cashable savings of at least 3% will be gained from e-ordering of agency staff, consolidated invoicing and or payment by purchasing card as well as use of a time and attendance system provided by Concept so no need to complete manual timesheets
- Concept Staffing propose a fixed charge of 54p per hour (fixed for the duration of the contract) on admin and operational staff so apart from legislative increases there will be no additional increases for the duration of the contract. Specialist is charged at a very competitive margin of 12%
- Overall minimum cashable savings for the four year contract for the Partnership are £150,000. Savings in years 2, 3 & 4 will be higher due to year on year market increases for other suppliers whereas Concept are holding their margin for the duration of the contract.

4.2 Example Savings for the administration category:

**NB High volume roles in yellow**

<b>15.24% Weighting on Admin as a total of the 50% weighting</b>								
<b>Job</b>	<b>Best Price</b>	<b>Agency</b>	<b>Current TDC</b>	<b>% Saving</b>	<b>Price 2008/9</b>	<b>% Saving</b>	<b>Current SHDC</b>	<b>% Saving</b>
Word Processing (V)	£7.72	Concept	£7.75	0.39%	£8.02	3.89%	£7.75	0.39%
Audio/Word Processor	£7.91	Penrose	£7.75	-2.06%	£8.02	1.39%	£7.75	-2.06%
Data Processor (V)	£7.40	Concept	£7.70	3.90%	£7.99	7.97%	£7.70	3.90%
Secretary	£8.27	4Front	£8.45	2.13%	£8.69	5.08%	£8.45	2.13%
Legal Secretary	£8.62	Concept	£8.90	3.15%	£9.01	4.52%	£8.90	3.15%
Customer Services Asst (V)	£7.72	Concept	£7.85	1.66%	£8.02	3.89%	£7.85	1.66%
Average				<b>1.53%</b>		<b>4.46%</b>		<b>1.53%</b>

Full pricing information and results can be found in appendix C

### Example saving in 2008/9 using the data above:

Teignbridge and South Hams used 16,469 hours on clerical admin in 2007/8 costing the Council £127,635 at £7.75 per hour with Pro Personnel

The approximate cost to Teignbridge and South Hams in 2008/9 for the same 16,469 hours with Pro Personnel will cost £132,081 at £8.02 per hour

The cost for 16,469 hours on clerical admin with Concept for 2008/9 will be £127,141 delivering a saving of £4,940

- From the results above Concept delivered the best price on 4 roles out of 6, which included all of the high volume roles
- If we compare concept prices to Pro Personnel pricing for next year the saving would be approximately 4.46% per hour, which doesn't include indirect saving costs of processing invoices
- Concept will hold the standard 54p margin on the admin roles for the duration of the contract (up to 4 Years), ensuring year on year savings for the Authorities. Obviously if there are rises in NI or holiday pay the prices will be brought in line with legislation

#### 4.3 Example Savings for the operational category:

16.69% Weighting on Operational as a total of the 50% Weighting									
Current Price									
Job	Best Price	Agency	TDC	New price 2008	% Saving 2008/9	SHDC	% Saving	WDBC	% Saving
LGV Driver	£9.51	Concept	£7.97	£11.64	22.40%				
Medium Vehicle Driver	£8.48	Jobshop	£7.87	£8.48	0.00%				
Driver/Operative	£8.02	Concept & Pro - Personnel	£7.87	£8.22	2.49%				
Recycling Loader (V)	£7.40	Concept	£7.35	£7.84	5.95%	£8.30	12.16%		
Refuse Loader (V)	£7.40	Concept	£7.35	£7.84	5.95%	£8.30	12.16%		
Vehicle Washer	£7.40	Concept	£7.35	£7.84	5.95%	£7.60	2.70%		
Street Sweeper (V)	£7.40	Concept	£7.35	£7.84	5.95%	£7.60	2.70%		
Toilet Cleaner	£7.40	Concept	£7.35	£7.84	5.95%	£7.60	2.70%		
Grounds Maintenance	£7.40	Concept	£7.35	£7.84	5.95%	£7.60	2.70%		
Catering Assistant	£7.40	Concept	£7.35	£7.84	5.95%	£7.60	2.70%		

					6.65%		5.41%		
Note: Job shop prices (current prices for TDC and some of South Hams) will increase to £7.84 in Oct 2008									

Full pricing information and results can be found in appendix C

**Example saving in 2008/9 using the data above:**

Teignbridge used 11,000 hours on refuse loaders in 2007/8 costing the Council £80,850 at £7.35 per hour with Jobshop. The approximate cost to Teignbridge in 2008/9 for the same 11,000 hours with Jobshop will cost £86,240 at £7.84 per hour. The cost for 11,000 hours on refuse loaders with Concept for 2008/9 will be £81,400 delivering a saving of £4,840

- Concept delivered best price on 9 out of 10 operational roles, although all are more than what Teignbridge currently pay, pricing for next year demonstrates a significant saving. South Hams will save a minimum of 5% on current pricing and more in 2008/9.
- By comparing Concept pricing to the prices we would be charged by Jobshop our current incumbent supplier the authorities will save in the region of 5-6% on operational roles per hour.
- Concept will hold the standard 54p margin on operational roles for the duration of the contract (up to 4 Years), ensuring year on year savings for the Authorities. Obviously if there are rises in NI or holiday pay the prices will be brought in line with legislation.

4.4 Example Savings for the administration category:

<b>18.08% Weighting on Specialist as a total of the 50% Weighting</b>									
	SHDC	Best Price	Supplier	TDC	Best Price	Supplier	West Devon	Best Price	Supplier
EHO	1385	£12.78	Brite		£12.78	Brite	354	£12.74	Tavistaff
Homelessness Prevention		£12.78	Brite	1776	£12.78	Brite		£12.78	Brite
Building Surveyor		£15.14	Pertemps	1628	£15.14	Pertemps		£15.14	Pertemps
Civil Engineering Assistant		£14.15	4Front		£14.15	4Front	619	£14.15	4Front
Benefits Assessor		£10.45	Concept	824	£10.45	Concept		£10.45	Concept

Full pricing information and results can be found in appendix C

- The figures above are the best prices for roles that the Councils used in 2007/8, data gathering on the above was a challenge due to the departments ordering themselves and not through a central point

By summarising all of the points allocated for all of the roles and taking an average the Specialist category came out as follows from a maximum of 18.08 points allocation (due to the category having 18.08% weighting on price:

<b>Specialist Summary</b>	
Shams Workforce	17.01
Brite	16.05
Tavistaff	15.04
4Front	14.95
Spring	14.22
Concept	13.74
Jobshop	13.46
Huntress	12.79
Wise	12.56
Reed	10.28

The results above demonstrate the best value for specialist roles and the top 4 of these suppliers have been selected to support the specialist requirements of the Councils ensuring a local provider. These support suppliers can also support other categories if Concept for whatever reason cannot deliver the admin and operational categories.

Concept staffing ensure not only that their support suppliers have service level agreements but all ensure they receive all of the margin for the placement which isn't evident with other master vendors.

## 5. Evaluation Process

- 5.1 The evaluation of offers was based upon the Most Economically Advantageous Tender (MEAT) and each aspect of the evaluation process was weighted against the authorities criteria of importance. The evaluation criteria as provided in the ITT were as follows:

<b>Criteria</b>	<b>% Weighting</b>
<b>Commercial considerations</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Financial Checks</li> <li>- Policies</li> <li>- Accreditation</li> <li>- References</li> </ul>	10%
<b>Technical considerations</b> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Technical questions</li> <li>- Ability to deliver specification</li> </ul>	30%

- Quality assurance - Innovation	
<b>Presentation</b> - Experience - Delivery of service	10%
<b>Pricing</b> - Affordability - Whole life costs	50%

5.2 The process of evaluation took into consideration the evaluation criteria and weightings above. Each element of the process for evaluation was weighted according to their relative importance. 42 suppliers were sent the PQQ (full details in appendix A), with 25 PQQ returns (Results of which can be found in Appendix B). 16 suppliers made it through to the ITT stage.

5.3 The stages involved in the procurement process were as follows:

Agency Staff (Restricted Procedure)	
Steps Taken	Dates
Advertise tender on www.devontenders.gov.uk and in local papers to get expressions of interest	18/04/2008
Prepare PQQ (Pre-qualification questionnaire)	
Send PQQ on www.devontenders.gov.uk	09/05/2008
Receipt of PQQ	30/05/2008
Evaluation of PQQ	13/06/2008
Prepare ITT (Invitation to Tender)	
Send Out ITT's on www.devontenders.gov.uk	20/06/2008
Supplier question day on ITT	02/07/2008
Return of ITT's	28/07/2008
Commercial & tech evaluation	08/08/2008
Supplier presentation Day	15/08/2008
Pricing Schedule evaluation	08/08/2008
Recommendation report	Nov/Dec 2008
Sign off by SMT/Exec	Nov/Dec 2008
Verbal award subject to	Early Dec
Cooling period (15 days)	
Feedback to Suppliers	Early Dec
Contract Award Letter	Mid Dec
Contract Start Date	March 2009
Contract Award Notice	January 2009

5.4 For example each question in the ITT technical question was weighted 1-3 with a maximum score of 0-5 and a potential weighted score therefore of 5-15 depending on importance. Copies of the individual tenderers scores and matrices are available upon request. Summary information on all aspects of

the tender can be found throughout the report and form appendices to the report.

## 6. Evaluation Results

Following the tender evaluation process defined in the Invitation to Tender and above the total score for each supplier based on total evaluation criteria and weightings were as follows:

			Commercial Response	Technical Response	Presentation	Pricing	Overall %
	Agency	Lot(s) Bidding for	10% Weighted	30% Weighted	10% Weighted	50% Weighted	
1	Reed	All categories, All Councils	7.00%	15.67%	7.03%	21%	50.70%
2	Blue Arrow	All categories, All Councils	7.57%	16.27%	7.79%	29%	60.63%
3	GAP	Operations, All Councils	6.71%	17.48%	7.56%	16%	47.75%
4	Concept	All categories, All Councils	7.14%	17.87%	7.20%	45%	77.21%
5	Brite	All categories, All Councils	5.71%	16.71%	5.17%	42%	69.59%
6	4Front	All categories, All Councils	7.43%	17.91%	5.19%	45%	75.53%
7	Huntress	Admin & Specialist, All Councils	6.71%	17.09%	7.58%	24%	55.38%
8	Jobline	Admin & Specialist, All Councils	7.57%	13.34%	5.92%	0	26.83%
9	Jobshop	All categories, All Councils	6.00%	15.76%	5.00%	43%	69.76%
10	Penrose	Admin & Ops, All Councils	6.43%	13.12%	4.34%	30%	53.89%
11	Pertemps	All categories, All Councils	7.29%	18.99%	7.75%	36%	70.03%
12	Pro Personnel	Admin & Ops, All Councils	6.00%	15.28%	6.50%	29%	56.78%
13	S. Hams Workforce	S. Hams only, All Categories	7.00%	15.41%	5.69%	44%	72.10%
14	Spring	TDC only, All Categories	7.29%	18.13%	8.22%	41%	74.64%
15	Tavistaff	WDBC only, All Categories	5.71%	15.88%	6.88%	28%	56.47%
16	Wise	All categories, All Councils	7.57%	17.61%	7.93%	42%	75.11%

The evaluation process demonstrated that Concept Staffing was the highest scoring Tenderer overall, based on overall tender evaluation. The basis for the overall evaluation criteria scores are demonstrated below:

Each tenderers score is based on the % of the total possible score for that section. The tenderers % score is then weighted according to the evaluation criteria to provide an overall total score. The tenderers % score for each element based on the total possible score is multiplied by the criteria weighting to provide a measurable score demonstrated below:

Score for Technical Questions	: 414
Score from possible max	: 695
% Score	: 59.6

Demonstrated as  $414/695*100=59.6$

This score is then weighted according to the criteria:

% Score for from possible	: 59.6
Weighted element for Technical questions:	: 30%
Total weighted score	: <b>17.88</b>

Demonstrated as  $59.6/100*30$

All scores are then compared between the tenderers to provide an overall assessment.

## **7. Benefits to Councils using Concept Staffing:**

- 7.1 The supplier owns the responsibility for managing the temporary workers and carries the associated risks of employment related claims. These include redundancy and unfair dismissal claims – the latter of which carries potential awards in excess of £50,000 per any one claim.
- 7.2 Robust and compliant recruitment processes minimising risk to the Councils in terms of poor performance and criminal actions. In addition improving the ‘retention’ of workers and maximising on any training costs invested by the Councils.
- 7.3 Service delivery with ‘Best Value’ assessed and proven.
- 7.4 Release of the Council’s management time in maintaining and managing the various supplier relationships.
- 7.5 This approach to employing temporary workers provides value to the temporary workers and the Councils and is in line with the ‘thinking’ of European Legislation for the future. It also meets our Best Value obligations.

## 8. **Ordering**

- 8.1 The supplier provides the facility for the online ordering of temporary workers on their own web based system. This will provide us with accurate management reporting on the number of current placements per department, the duration of these placements, and the cost. It is intended that the current departmental ordering points will remain the same with a central ordering point for the Councils where possible (for admin and specialist) and operations a separate central ordering point, which will enable a close working relationship with the supplier and internal stakeholders with regular communication to resolve any issues regarding the supply of workers.

## 9. **General Comments about Concept Staffing**

- The supplier proposes that all of the temporary workers will be engaged under Contracts of Employment. This firmly places the employment relationship of the temporary worker and responsibility with the Supplier.
- In addition all temporary workers will be assessed/vetted and selected via the supplier's robust and consistent processes, ensuring consistency across departments.
- 17 branches in the SW including Newton Abbot, Torquay, Plymouth, Okehampton and Exeter covering all of the geographical locations
- Able to service all Lots – admin, operational and specialist
- 20 years experience, locally service Exeter City Council for all of their agency requirements and Devon County Council
- Service Level Agreement s - 2 hour response time
- 24 hour phone line, core business hours
- Transport for workers will form part of the package to get them to their place of work if they do not drive
- Networked candidate database and full MI package available
- On-line placement ordering
- Willing to introduce time & attendance system at no additional cost

- As a master vendor this removes the non-value added administration in the process of ordering and paying for agency staff

## **10. Summary Conclusion & Recommendation**

- 10.1 The recommendation is for the Councils to agree to Concept Staffing delivering our Agency Staff requirements for the next 3 years as a master vendor arrangement, with an option to extend for a further year to 2013
- 10.2 That the Councils agree to stipulating the support suppliers the benefits of this being a single admin process with the flexibility to deliver specialist staff locally, therefore supporting local businesses. The suppliers being Brite, 4Front, Tavistaff and South Hams Workforce
- 10.3 That the Councils agree their preferred operational approach to support the implementation process prior to implementation.
- 10.4 **It must be recognised that businesses in the current economic environment need cashflow, although it is difficult in some instances I think as Councils we need to be promoting the use of Government Procurement cards to pay our suppliers real time to ease their financial burden.**
- 10.5 That the contract is mandated to ensure that maverick spend is a thing of the past and to ensure the rebate potential is realised.

Appendix A

**Agency Staff - Suppliers List Sent PQQ**

ITT Sent Back

Contact Name	Company	Dept	Address	Tel/Fax/Email
Mrs Joanna Norris	Blue Arrow Ltd	Bid Management	800 The Boulevard Luton Bedfordshire LU1 3BA	☎ 582 692926 ☎ 582 698569 ✉anna.norris@bluearrow.co.uk
Mr James Letten	South Hams Workforce Ltd	Accounts	Unit A, The Scope Complex Totnes Devon TQ9 5XN	☎ 803 862557 ☎ 803 863852 ✉fo@southhamsworkforce.co.uk
Mr Doug Kelsall	4front Recruitment Ltd	N/A	1A The Avenue Newton Abbot Devon TQ12 2BZ	☎ 45 226 3491 ☎ 45 226 3492 ✉oug@4frontuk.co.uk
Ms Debbie Mitchell	Pertemps Recruitment Partnership Ltd	Corporate Sales	Gap House, Longwood Court Cirencester Gloucestershire GL7 1YG	☎ 285 885599 ☎ 285 657695 ✉ebbie.mitchell@pertemps.co.uk
Mrs tamlyn fraiquin	Reed	Employment	50-52 High Street Exeter Devon EX4 3DJ	☎ 392 262670 ☎ 392 262675 ✉amlyn.fraiquin@reed.co.uk
Mr Neil Fogarty	IMS Interim Executives	Public Sector Practice	Wightfield Manor Tewkesbury Gloucestershire GL19 4DP	☎ 78619670 ☎ 78619671 ✉eil.fogarty@ims.uk.com
Mrs Emma-Jane Wood	Jobline Staffing	Jobline Staffing	Pydar House Truro Cornwall TR1 1EA	☎ 872 322812 ☎ 872 225380 ✉mma-jane.wood@joblinestaffing.co.uk

Mrs Hayley Bilney	Redpoint UK Ltd	Business Development	23 High Street Delabole Cornwall PL33 9AA	☎ 840 214906 ☎ 840 214906 ✉ Hayley@redpointconsultancy.com
Mr Russell Badger	Manpower	Torquay	45a union street torquay Devon TQ1 1ET	☎ 803 214591 ☎ 803 215455 ✉ russ.badger@manpower.co.uk
Mr Bruce Jones	WA Consultants Ltd	Sales	Emblem House Exeter Devon EX2 5BA	☎ 392 666060 ☎ 392 666070 ✉ b@waconsultants.com
Mr Paul Penrose	Penrose Personnel Ltd	Sales	2, Offwell Barton Honiton Devon EX14 9SA	☎ 970 728821 ☎ 404 831079 ✉ paul@penrosepersonnel.co.uk
Miss Allison Kelleway	s Advanced Resource Managers IT Limited	Business Development	Langstone Technology Park Havant Hampshire PO9 1SA	☎ 2392 228228 ☎ 2392 228229 ✉ alisonk@arm.co.uk
Mrs Jo Adkins	Pro Personnel	Personnel	11 Market Street Newton Abbot Devon TQ12 2RJ	☎ 626 368447 ☎ 626 368448 ✉ joanna@pro-personnel.co.uk
Mr Gareth Brocklehurst	G.A.P. Recruitment	Head Office	218 Torquay Road Paignton Devon TQ3 2HN	☎ 803 520850 ☎ 803 520851 ✉ g@o@g-a-p-recruitment.co.uk
Mr Stephen Greer	Greer Recruitment Services Ltd	County House	County House Plymouth Devon	☎ 752 312471 ☎ 752 312742 ✉ stephen@greerrecruitment.co.uk

			PL1 2HR	
Mrs Dawn Scullion	Concorde Recruitment	Concorde Recruitment Devon	First Floor 25-26 Exeter Devon EX4 3LS	☎ 392 213333 ☎ 392 434880 ✉ e@cornwall.ac.uk
Mrs Jackie Carson	Wise Employment	Business Development	104 Commercial Rd Swindon Wiltshire SN1 5PL	☎ 793-416650 ☎ 793-416651 ✉ ckiec@wiseemployment.co.uk
Mr Roger Forsythe	Roger Forsythe Consultancy	Training	The Holt Paignton Devon TQ3 1XA	☎ 803 521239 ☎ 803 521239 ✉ rger@fossie.fsbusiness.co.uk
Mr Robin Littlewood	Littlewood Stuart Recruitment Ltd	Commercial	9, The Crescent Plymouth Devon PL1 3AB	☎ 752 250222 ☎ 752 258999 ✉ bin@littlewood-stuart.co.uk
Miss Harriet Kirby-Turner	ReThink Recruitment	Bristol	66 Queen Square Bristol Avon BS1 4JP	☎ 17 987 6266 ☎ 17 987 6267 ✉ kirbyturner@rethink-recruitment.com
Mr Philip Horrod	Hays Specialist Recruitment Ltd	Hays Public Services	24 White Hart Street  Buckinghamshire HP11 2HL	☎ 872 158 552 ☎ 207 068 5422 ✉ enders@hays.com
Dr Sadie Reynolds	Calibre Solutions Limited	Managing Director	The Innovation Centre, Commerce House. Bicester Oxfordshire OX26 4LD	☎ 869 249385  ☎ 869 322241 ✉ sadie@calibre-solutions.co.uk
Mrs Tina Scanlan	Backline Logistics Support	Accounts	1 Midvale Road	☎ 803 668849

	Services		Paignton Devon TQ4 5BD	☎ 803 666717 ✉ ma.scanlan@backlinelogistics.co.uk
Mrs Sally Renshaw	Tavistaff Recruitment Services	Recruitment	1st Floor Lockyer House Tavistock Devon PL19 0HF	☎ 822 618720 ☎ 822 617539 ✉ sally@tavistaff.co.uk
Mrs Sarah Hughes	Kelly Services	Sales	Apple Market House Kingston upon Thames Surrey KT1 1RR	☎ 889 708 981 ☎ 20 8481 1299 ✉ sjerjec@kellyservices.co.uk
Ms Janelle Larsson	Huntress Search Ltd	Head Office	Imperial House  London WC2B 6UN	☎ 20 7744 1300 ☎ 20 7744 1301 ✉ janelle.larsson@huntress.co.uk
Mr Martin Campbell	Campbell Jackson Ltd	Driving	Unit 36 Teignbridge Business Centre Newton Abbot Devon TQ12 6TZ	☎ 626 832903  ✉ martin.campbell@campbelljackson.co.uk
Mrs Rachel Sansom	Just Accounts Recruitment Ltd	Accounts, Office and Commercial	364 Faraday Mill Trade Park Plymouth Devon PL4 0SP	☎ 752 255585  ✉ Rachel@justaccountsrecruitment.co.uk
Mr Richard Walsh	Job Shop Recruitment Services SW Ltd	Head Office	1 Church Street Paignton Devon TQ4 6LB	☎ 803 520900 ☎ 803 669007 ✉ Richard@job-shop-devon.co.uk
Miss Alison Vaughan	Lloyd Barnes Accountancy Recruitment	n/a	1 Emperor Way Exeter Devon	☎ 392 314552 ☎ 392 314001 ✉ Alison@lloyd-barnes.co.uk

			EX1 3QS	
Mrs Liz Robinson	Westaff UK Ltd	Head Office	46-50 Southgate Street Gloucester Gloucestershire GL1 2DR	☎ 452 304090 ☎ 452 300332 ✉ z.robinson@westaff.co.uk
Mr Glen Fiorini	Frontline Recruitment Specialists	Recruitment	1st Floor, Mayflower House Plymouth Devon PL1 1LD	☎ 752 242570 ☎ 752 302701 ✉ gfiorini@frontlinepersonnel.co.uk
Mrs Maggie Atkinson	SES RECRUITMENT CONSULTANTS LTD	Head Office	1 Union Street Newton Abbot Devon TQ12 2JX	☎ 26362172 ✉ maggie@ses-recruitment.co.uk
Mr James Thorpe	RPS Consultants Ltd	Health, Safety & Environment	Opus House, Manor Court Basingstoke Hampshire RG25 2PH	☎ 256 381050 ☎ 256 381910 ✉ jthorpej@rpsgroup.com
Mr Alasdair Linn	Workforce	Head Office	Victoria Chambers Barnstaple Devon EX31 1JB	☎ 271 372783 ☎ 271 379627 ✉ alasdair@workforce-jobs.co.uk
Mr Damian Speirs	MVM Recruitment Ltd	Recruitment Consultant	6th Floor Embassy House Clifton, Bristol Avon BS8 1SB	☎ 73116433 ☎ 73116458 ✉ damians@mvmr.co.uk
Mr Dean Croft	Paramount Personnel Ltd	Paramount Personnel	48 Queen Street Exeter Devon EX4 3SR	☎ 392 221600 ☎ 392 221601 ✉ dean@paramountpersonnel.com
Mr Mike Gater	Spring Personnel Ltd	Corporate Solutions	Unit 3010 The Pavilions Birmingham	☎ 21 788 6740 ☎ 21 788 6810

			West Midlands B37 7YE	<a href="mailto:Mike_gater@spring.com">Mike_gater@spring.com</a>
Mrs Alison Menchaca	Gainful Employment	commercial	6a Webbers Way Totnes Devon TQ9 6JY	☎ 803 865900 <a href="mailto:Alison@gainfulemployment.co.uk">Alison@gainfulemployment.co.uk</a>
Miss Nicky Clayton	Brite Recruitment	Recruitment	South Devon House Newton Abbot Devon TQ12 2BP	☎ 626 280077 ☎ 626 336939 <a href="mailto:Devon@briteservices.co.uk">Devon@briteservices.co.uk</a>
Miss Joanne Caine	Cathedral Appointments	Recruitment	33-35 Southernhay East EXETER Devon EX1 1NX	☎ 392 413577 ☎ 392 425690 <a href="mailto:Jo@cathedralappointments.co.uk">Jo@cathedralappointments.co.uk</a>
Ms Jane Hunt	Concept Staffing	Recruitment	Wessex House Teign Road Newton Abbot TQ12 4AA	01803 215222 01626 360249 <a href="mailto:janehunt@conceptstaffing.co.uk">janehunt@conceptstaffing.co.uk</a>

Appendix B

PQQ Scores											
		10%			30%				Total 40%		
No	Supplier	Commercial Score out of 70		Commercial Weighted Score	Tech Score out of 80	SA Questions score out of 115		Technical weighted score	Overall score out of 265	Weighted overall score	Ranking
1	Forefront	52	0.74	7.43%	58	81	0.71	21.38%	191	28.81%	4
2	Backline	45	0.64	6.43%	33	55	0.45	13.54%	133	19.97%	20
3	Blue Arrow	53	0.76	7.57%	56	83	0.71	21.38%	192	28.96%	2
4	Brite	40	0.57	5.71%	51	59	0.56	16.92%	150	22.64%	14
5	Concept	50	0.71	7.14%	54	72	0.65	19.38%	176	26.53%	6
6	Concorde	37	0.53	5.29%	36	60	0.49	14.77%	133	20.05%	19
7	Frontline	Did not submit the PQQ - decided to pull out from the process									
8	GAP	47	0.67	6.71%	48	73	0.62	18.62%	168	25.33%	9
9	Greer	31	0.44	4.43%	43	48	0.47	14.00%	122	18.43%	23
10	Huntress	47	0.67	6.71%	48	83	0.67	20.15%	178	26.87%	5
11	Jobshop	42	0.60	6.00%	56	59	0.59	17.69%	157	23.69%	12
12	Jobline	53	0.76	7.57%	42	56	0.50	15.08%	151	22.65%	13
13	Just Accounts	39	0.56	5.57%	40	55	0.49	14.62%	134	20.19%	17
14	Littlewood Stuart	30	0.43	4.29%	40	60	0.51	15.38%	130	19.67%	22
15	Lloyd Barns	45	0.64	6.43%	33	56	0.46	13.69%	134	20.12%	18
16	MVM	ICT Specialists only - not suitable for Council's needs									
17	Penrose	45	0.64	6.43%	52	62	0.58	17.54%	159	23.97%	11
18	Pertemps	51	0.73	7.29%	50	90	0.72	21.54%	191	28.82%	3
19	Pro Personnel	42	0.60	6.00%	51	69	0.62	18.46%	162	24.46%	10
20	Reed	49	0.70	7.00%	45	75	0.62	18.46%	169	25.46%	7
21	South Hams Workforce	49	0.70	7.00%	45	49	0.48	14.46%	143	21.46%	15
22	Spring	51	0.73	7.29%	51	67	0.61	18.15%	169	25.44%	8
23	Tavistaff	40	0.57	5.71%	41	61	0.52	15.69%	142	21.41%	16

24	<b>WA Consultants</b>	45	0.64	6.43%	38	49	0.45	13.38%	132	19.81%	<b>21</b>
25	<b>Wise</b>	64	0.91	9.14%	51	80	0.67	20.15%	195	29.30%	<b>1</b>

## Appendix C – Overall Results

Evaluation Results Summary: Agency Temporary Staff Contract			Categories are:			Operational, Admin. and Specialist			Small		
Evaluated By: Mel Staton, John Calderwood, Andy Wilson, Cat Watters, James Weldon			Areas to Cover:			Teignbridge, South Hams and West Devon			Large		
Collaborative Contract for South Hams, Teignbridge & West Devon											
Section of Tender											
		Commercial Response		Technical Response		Presentation		Total Marks	Pricing %	Overall %	Ranking
	Lot(s) Bidding for	10% Weighted	Score out of 70	30% Weighted	Score out of 695	10% Weighted	Score out of 80	Out of 845			
Reed	All categories, All Councils	7.00%	49	15.67%	363	7.03%	56	468	0.21	50.70%	14th
Blue Arrow	All categories, All Councils	7.57%	53	16.27%	377	7.79%	62	492	0.29	60.63%	9th
GAP	Operations, All Councils	6.71%	47	17.48%	405	7.56%	61	513	0.16	47.75%	15th
Concept	All categories, All Councils	7.14%	50	17.87%	414	7.20%	58	522	0.45	77.21%	1st
Brite	All categories, All Councils	5.71%	40	16.71%	387	5.17%	41	468	0.42	69.59%	7th
4Front	All categories, All Councils	7.43%	52	17.91%	415	5.19%	42	509	0.45	75.53%	3rd
Huntress	Admin & Specialist, All Councils	6.71%	47	17.09%	396	7.58%	61	504	0.24	55.38%	12th
Jobline	Admin & Specialist, All Councils	7.57%	53	13.34%	309	5.92%	47	409	0.00	26.83%	16th
Jobshop	All categories, All Councils	6.00%	42	15.76%	365	5.00%	40	447	0.43	69.76%	8th
Penrose	Admin & Ops, All Councils	6.43%	45	13.12%	304	4.34%	35	384	0.30	53.89%	13th
Pertemps	All categories, All Councils	7.29%	51	18.99%	440	7.75%	62	553	0.36	70.03%	6th
Pro Personnel	Admin & Ops, All Councils	6.00%	42	15.28%	354	6.50%	52	448	0.29	56.78%	10th
S. Hams Workforce	S. Hams only, All Categories	7.00%	49	15.41%	357	5.69%	46	452	0.44	72.10%	5th
Spring	TDC only, All Categories	7.29%	51	18.13%	420	8.22%	66	537	0.41	74.64%	4th
Tavistaff	WDBC only, All Categories	5.71%	40	15.88%	368	6.88%	55	463	0.28	56.47%	11th
Wise	All categories, All Councils	9.14%	64	17.61%	408	7.93%	63	468	0.42	75.11%	2nd

Appendix D - Pricing Schedule Summary

Administration Category: Lot 1 Percentage allocation from a maximum of 15.24%

Admin - WP Clerical	Price	%	Ranking
Concept	£7.72	15.24	1
Penrose	£7.91	14.87	2
Wise	£7.92	14.86	3
4Front	£8.07	14.58	4
Jobshop	£8.22	14.31	5
Pro Personnel	£8.02 +£8.69	14.29	6
Blue Arrow	£8.55	13.76	7
Pertemps	£8.61	13.66	8
Tavistaff	£8.65	13.60	9
Shams Workforce	£8.73	13.48	10
Spring	£9.04	13.01	11
Brite	£9.52	12.36	12
Huntress	£9.98	11.79	13
Reed	£9.52- £11.05	10.65	14

Admin - Audio WP	Price	%	Ranking
Penrose	£7.91	15.24	1
4Front	£8.07	14.94	2
Concept	£8.08	14.92	3
Pro Personnel	£8.02+ £8.69	14.64	4
Jobshop	£8.36	14.42	5
Wise	£8.58	14.05	6
Shams Workforce	£8.73	13.81	7
Blue Arrow	£9.15	13.17	8
Brite	£10.20	11.82	9
Spring	£10.22	11.80	10
Reed	£10.29	11.72	11
Huntress	£10.44	11.55	12
Pertemps	£10.66	11.31	13

Admin - Data Processing	Price	%	Ranking
Concept	£7.40	15.24	1
Penrose	£7.91	14.26	2
Wise	£7.92	14.24	3
4Front	£8.07	13.97	4
Pro Personnel	£7.99 +£8.30	13.94	5
Brite	£8.16	13.82	6
Jobshop	£8.22	13.72	7
Blue Arrow	£8.55	13.19	8
Shams Workforce	£8.60	13.11	9
Tavistaff	£8.65	13.04	10
Spring	£8.73	12.92	11
Pertemps	£9.11	12.38	12
Huntress	£9.98	11.30	13
Reed	£9.52- £11.05	10.21	14

Admin - Secretary	Price	%	Ranking
4Front	£8.27	15.24	1

Admin - Legal Secretary	Price	%	Ranking
Concept	£8.62	15.24	1

Admin - Customer Service Asst.	Price	%	Ranking
Concept	£7.72	15.24	1

Concept	£8.32	15.15	2
Jobshop	£8.50	14.83	3
Wise	£8.58	14.69	4
Pertemps	£8.61	14.64	5
Pro Personnel	£8.69 +£9.65	14.02	6
Blue Arrow	£9.15	13.77	7
Penrose	£9.28	13.58	8
Shams Workforce	£10.26	12.28	9
Brite	£10.54	11.96	10
Tavistaff	£10.82	11.65	11
Spring	£10.84	11.63	12
Huntress	£11.18	11.27	13
Reed	£11.81- £13.34	9.95	14

4Front	£8.96	14.66	2
Wise	£9.24	14.22	3
Pro Personnel	£9.01+ £10.29	13.98	4
Jobshop	£9.50	13.83	5
Blue Arrow	£9.75+ £9.15	13.77	6
Shams Workforce	£10.26	12.80	7
Penrose	£10.39	12.64	8
Brite	£10.54	12.46	9
Pertemps	£10.66	12.32	10
Tavistaff	£11.54	11.38	11
Spring	£11.71	11.22	12
Huntress	£11.92	11.02	14
Reed	£13.34 - £14.87	8.83	15

Penrose	£7.91	14.87	2
Wise	£7.92	14.86	3
Blue Arrow	£7.95	14.80	4
4Front	£8.07	14.58	5
Jobshop	£8.22	14.31	6
Pro Personnel	£8.02+ £8.69	14.29	7
Tavistaff	£8.65	13.60	8
Brite	£8.84	13.31	9
Pertemps	£9.22	12.76	10
Spring	£9.54	12.33	11
Huntress	£9.98	11.79	12
Shams Workforce	£10.73	10.96	13
Reed	£10.29 - £11.81	9.96	14

Operational Category: Lot 2 Percentage allocation from a maximum of 16.69%

Operations - LGV Driver	Price	%	Ranking
Concept	£9.51	16.69	1
GAP	£10.32	15.38	2
Wise	£10.56	15.03	3
Spring	£10.59	14.99	4
Penrose	£11.01	14.42	5
4Front	£11.03	14.39	6
Blue Arrow	£11.35	13.98	7
Brite	£11.36	13.97	8
Pro Personnel	£11.58	13.71	9
Jobshop	£11.64	13.64	10
Pertemps	£11.99	13.24	11
Shams Workforce	£12.10	13.12	12

Operations - Medium Driver	Price	%	Ranking
Jobshop	£8.48	16.69	1
Concept	£8.62	16.42	2
Spring	£8.73	16.21	3
Penrose	£8.75	16.12	4
4Front	£8.96	15.80	5
Shams Workforce	£8.98	15.76	6
Pro Personnel	£9.01	15.71	7
GAP	£9.24	15.32	8
Wise	£9.24	15.32	8
Blue Arrow	£9.75+£9.15	14.99	9
Brite	£9.94	14.24	10
Pertemps	£10.22	13.85	11

Operations - Driver Operative	Price	%	Ranking
Concept	£8.02	16.69	1
Pro Personnel	£8.02	16.69	1
Penrose	£8.03	16.67	2
Jobshop	£8.22	16.28	3
Blue Arrow	£8.25	16.22	4
GAP	£8.25	16.22	4
4Front	£8.27	16.19	5
Wise	£8.58	15.60	6
Pertemps	£8.88	15.07	7
Shams Workforce	£8.98	14.91	8
Brite	£9.23	14.50	9
Spring	£9.35	14.32	10

Operations - Recycling Loader	Price	%	Ranking
Concept	£7.40	16.69	1
Wise	£7.45	16.58	2
GAP	£7.58	16.29	3
Penrose	£7.59	16.27	4
Jobshop	£7.84	15.75	5
Pertemps	£7.88	15.67	6

Operations - Refuse Loader	Price	%	Ranking
Concept	£7.40	16.69	1
Wise	£7.45	16.58	2
GAP	£7.58	16.29	3
Penrose	£7.59	16.27	4
Jobshop	£7.84	15.75	5
Pertemps	£7.88	15.67	6

Operations - Vehicle Washer	Price	%	Ranking
Concept	£7.40	16.69	1
Wise	£7.45	16.58	2
Penrose	£7.59	16.27	3
Blue Arrow	£7.65	16.14	4
Jobshop	£7.84	15.75	5
Spring	£7.86	15.71	6

4Front	£7.93	15.57	7
Blue Arrow	£7.95	15.54	8
Pro Personnel	£7.99	15.46	9
Brite	£8.13	15.19	10
Shams Workforce	£8.16	15.14	11
Spring	£9.35	13.21	12

4Front	£7.93	15.57	7
Blue Arrow	£7.95	15.54	8
Pro Personnel	£7.99	15.46	9
Brite	£8.13	15.19	10
Shams Workforce	£8.16	15.14	11
Spring	£9.35	13.21	12

GAP	£7.92	15.59	7
4Front	£7.93	15.57	8
Pro Personnel	£7.99	15.46	9
Shams Workforce	£8.16	15.14	10
Brite	£9.23	13.38	11
Pertemps	£11.55	10.69	12

Operations - Street Sweeper	Price		Ranking
		%	
Concept	£7.40	16.69	1
Wise	£7.45	16.58	2
Penrose	£7.59	16.27	3
Blue Arrow	£7.65	16.14	4
Jobshop	£8.48	15.75	5
Pertemps	£7.88	15.67	6
GAP	£7.92	15.59	7
4Front	£7.93	15.57	8
Pro Personnel	£7.99	15.46	9
Shams Workforce	£8.16	15.14	10
Brite	£9.23	13.38	11
Spring	£9.35	13.21	12

Operations - Toilet Cleaner	Price		Ranking
		%	
Blue Arrow	£7.65+£6.65	16.42	1
Concept	£7.40	15.84	2
Wise	£7.45	15.74	3
Penrose	£7.59	15.45	4
Shams Workforce	£8.16	15.14	5
Pertemps	£7.88	14.88	6
GAP	£7.92	14.80	7
4Front	£7.93	14.79	8
Pro Personnel	£7.99	14.67	9
Jobshop	£8.08	14.51	10
Spring	£8.11	13.69	11
Brite	£9.94	11.80	12

Operations - Ground Maintenance	Price		Ranking
		%	
Concept	£7.40	16.69	1
Wise	£7.45	16.58	2
Penrose	£7.59	16.27	3
Pertemps	£7.88	15.67	4
GAP	£7.92	15.59	5
4Front	£7.93	15.57	6
Pro Personnel	£7.99	15.46	7
Jobshop	£8.48	14.56	8
Spring	£8.73	14.15	9
Blue Arrow	£9.15	13.50	10
Shams Workforce	£9.60	12.87	11
Brite	£9.94	12.43	12

<b>Operations - Catering Assistant</b>	<b>Price</b>	<b>%</b>	<b>Ranking</b>
Blue Arrow	£6.65	16.69	1
Concept	£7.40	15.00	2
Wise	£7.45	14.90	3
GAP	£7.58	14.64	4
Penrose	£7.59	14.62	5
Jobshop	£7.84	14.16	6
Pertemps	£7.88	14.08	7
4Front	£7.93	14.00	8
Pro Personnel	£7.99	13.89	9
Spring	£8.11	13.69	10
Brite	£8.13	13.65	11
Shams Workforce	£8.16	13.60	12

Specialist Category: Lot 3 Percentage allocation from a maximum of 18.08%

Specialist - Environmental Health Officer	Price	%	Ranking
Tavistaff	£12.74	18.08	1
Brite	£12.78	18.06	2
Shams Workforce	£13.19	17.52	3
Huntress	£17.90	12.90	4
4Front	£19.10	12.08	5
Concept	£19.68	11.73	6
Jobshop	£16.45-£19.73	11.70	7
Spring	£23.39	9.88	8
Reed	£16.39-£24.03	9.61	9
Wise	£33.75	6.84	10
Pertemps	£38.69	5.97	11

Specialist - Housing Prevention Officer	Price	%	Ranking
Brite	£12.78	18.08	1
Shams Workforce	£13.19	17.52	2
4Front	£14.86	15.55	3
Spring	£15.35	15.05	4
Jobshop	£13.18-£16.45	14.05	5
Concept	£17.29	13.36	6
Tavistaff	£18.75	12.32	7
Wise	£21.60	10.70	8
Pertemps	£22.22	10.40	9
Huntress	£22.37	10.33	10
Reed	£16.39-£24.03	9.62	11

Specialist - Building Surveyor	Price	%	Ranking
Jobshop	£11.78-£15.14	18.08	1
Spring	£15.35	17.02	2
Shams Workforce	£17.30	15.82	3
Brite	£18.46	14.83	4
Tavistaff	£18.75	14.60	5
Huntress	£22.37	12.24	6
Concept	£23.27	11.76	7
4Front	£24.76	11.06	8
Wise	£35.10	7.80	9
Reed	£27.08-£36.24	7.55	10
Pertemps	£40.32	6.79	11

Specialist - Planning Officer	Price	%	Ranking
Shams	£26.85	18.08	1

Specialist - Architectural Assistant	Price	%	Ranking
Shams	£13.55	18.08	1

Specialist - Civil Eng Assist	Price	%	Ranking
4Front	£14.15	18.08	1

Workforce			
4Front	£16.26	17.74	2
Brite	£18.46	15.62	3
Tavistaff	£22.49	13.07	4
Spring	£23.10	12.73	5
Huntress	£26.85	10.74	6
Concept	£26.86	10.74	6
Wise	£27.00	10.68	7
Jobshop	£20.55- £27.41	10.52	8
Reed	£22.50- £30.15	9.57	9
Pertemps	£37.05	7.37	10

Workforce			
Brite	£14.20	17.80	2
Huntress	£14.91	16.96	3
Spring	£16.08	15.97	4
Tavistaff	£16.49	15.57	5
4Front	£17.68	14.30	6
Concept	£18.49	13.67	7
Jobshop	£15.07- £19.18	13.18	8
Reed	£14.87- £20.97	12.06	9
Wise	£21.06	12.00	10
Pertemps	£26.54	9.53	11

Brite	£14.20	18.02	2
Jobshop	£13.18- £17.13	14.93	3
Spring	£17.54	14.59	4
Wise	£17.55	14.58	5
Shams Workforce	£17.94	14.26	6
Tavistaff	£18.75	13.64	7
Concept	£20.88	12.25	8
Reed	£14.87- £20.97	12.20	9
Huntress	£22.37	11.44	10
Pertemps	£29.73	8.61	11

Specialist - Benefits Assessor	Price	%	Ranking
Concept	£10.45	18.08	1
Shams Workforce	£12.54	15.07	2
4Front	£12.73	14.84	3
Spring	£13.16	14.36	4
Jobshop	£11.16- £13.18	14.34	5
Wise	£14.04	13.46	6
Huntress	£14.91	12.67	7

Specialist - Revenue Officer	Price	%	Ranking
Shams Workforce	£10.26	18.08	1
Concept	£11.31	17.52	2
4Front	£12.73	15.57	3
Spring	£16.06	12.72	4
Huntress	£17.90	11.07	5
Brite	£18.46	10.73	6
Jobshop	£16.44-	10.04	7

Specialist - ICT Analyst - Progr.	Price	%	Ranking
Tavistaff	£18.75	18.75	1
Shams Workforce	£16.48	18.08	2
4Front	£19.80	16.96	3
Jobshop	£16.44- £21.75	15.44	4
Spring	£23.39	15.31	5
Brite	£22.72	14.78	6
Huntress	£26.85	12.51	7

Tavistaff	£18.03	10.48	8
Brite	£18.46	10.23	9
Reed	£13.34-£20.97	9.01	10
Pertemps	£29.73	6.36	11

	£19.73		
Pertemps	£20.70	9.57	8
Reed	13.34-£20.97	9.45	9
Tavistaff	£25.97	7.87	10

Wise	£28.35	11.85	8
Reed	£19.45-£30.13	11.15	9
Concept	£30.45	11.03	10
Pertemps	£37.05	9.06	11

Specialist - ICT Infrastructure	Price	%	Ranking
Shams Workforce	£10.60	18.08	1
Tavistaff	£11.25	18.08	1
Brite	£12.78	16.33	2
4Front	£13.09	15.94	3
Wise	£15.44	13.52	4
Pertemps	£17.67	11.81	5
Huntress	£17.90	11.66	6
Reed	£13.34-£17.92	11.65	7
Concept	£18.49	11.29	8
Jobshop	£13.18-£19.73	10.58	9
Spring	£24.85	9.30	10

Specialist - Legal Executive	Price	%	Ranking
Shams Workforce	£13.55	18.08	1
4Front	£15.52	17.32	2
Brite	£15.62	17.20	3
Tavistaff	£17.24	16.28	4
Concept	£17.29	15.54	5
Wise	£17.55	15.31	6
Spring	£20.47	13.71	7
Huntress	£20.14	13.34	8
Pertemps	£22.22	12.09	9
Jobshop	£16.44-£23.05	11.66	10
Reed	£17.92-£27.08	9.92	11

Specialist - Solicitor	Price	%	Ranking
Shams Workforce	£20.39	18.08	1
Brite	£22.72	17.46	2
Jobshop	£19.73-£23.44	16.93	3
Concept	£24.47	16.21	4
Wise	£24.58	16.14	5
Spring	£25.73	15.96	6
Tavistaff	£29.99	13.70	7
4Front	£30.34	13.08	8
Huntress	£33.56	11.82	9
Pertemps	£40.32	9.84	10
Reed	£22.50-£45.40	8.74	11

Specialist - HR Officer	Price	%	Ranking
Brite	£12.78	18.08	1
Concept	£14.90	15.51	2
Jobshop	£13.18- £16.44	14.05	3
Shams Workforce	£16.48	14.02	4
Wise	£17.55	13.17	5
4Front	£17.68	13.07	6
Tavistaff	£18.03	12.82	7
Spring	£19.01	12.15	8
Pertemps	£20.70	11.16	9
Huntress	£22.37	10.33	10
Reed	£16.39- £24.03	9.62	11

Specialist - Manager	Price	%	Ranking
Shams Workforce	£13.55	18.08	1
Brite	£14.20	17.80	2
Huntress	£14.91	16.96	3
Spring	£16.08	15.97	4
Tavistaff	£16.49	15.57	5
4Front	£17.68	14.30	6
Concept	£18.49	13.67	7
Jobshop	£15.07- £19.08	13.18	8
Reed	£14.87- £20.97	12.06	9
Wise	£21.06	12.00	10
Pertemps	£26.54	9.53	11

Specialist - Accountant	Price	%	Ranking
Shams Workforce	£22.72	18.08	1
Tavistaff	£22.49	18.08	1
Brite	£22.72	16.58	2
Spring	£24.85	16.53	3
Wise	£31.58	11.93	4

Specialist - Accounts Technician	Price	%	Ranking

Specialist - Accounts Assistant	Price	%	Ranking
Tavistaff	£10.10	18.08	1
Wise	£10.53	17.83	2
Shams Workforce	£10.85	17.55	3
Brite	£12.78	14.69	4
Spring	£13.16	14.47	5



Appendix D: Summary Pricing/Affordability

Additional Pricing information								
		Lot(s) Bidding for	Cost or % Charged for temp to perm	Length of time for temp to perm to cost nothing	If past placement temp to perm timescale	Invoicing Process	Electronic Methods	Added value
1	Reed	All categories, All Councils	0,00-19,999 - 12% 20,000 - 29,999 - 15% 30,000 - 17%	13 weeks	8 weeks from the end of the assignment	14 days	BACS	Nothing entered
2	Blue Arrow	All categories, All Councils	0 – 4 weeks 10% 5 – 8 weeks 8% 9 – 13 weeks 5%	13 weeks	8 weeks	consolidated invoicing weekly, fortnightly or monthly	BACS	My Bluetime - online booking and timesheet system
3	GAP	Operations, All Councils	£350 + VAT flat fee	10 weeks	8 weeks	Fortnightly online	BACS	
4	Concept	All categories, All Councils	no fee	no fee	no fee	weekly basis consolidated and in arrears for wages relating to the current week being processed	BACS & will set up for Pcard payments if council require	on-line placement ordering. Willing to introduce time & attendance system at no additional cost. 0.5% rebate on £800k spend
5	Brite	All categories, All Councils	5% Cost	14 weeks	10 weeks	standard frequency is weekly	BACS is preferred method	Customised spreadsheet detailing costs and hours per department and is consolidated into a single

								invoice.
6	4Front	All categories, All Councils	Missing Info	8 continuous weeks	Up to 8 weeks work in last 12 months	standard is weekly. But only process one monthly payment	Flexible to our requirements	1. Contact UK HR/Agent software
7	Huntress	Admin & Specialist, All Councils	Weeks 0 – 4 = 14% Weeks 5 – 8 = 12% Weeks 9 – 12 = 10% Weeks 13 – 16 = 5%	16 weeks	8 weeks from the last day working on assignment with the Council or 14 weeks from the start of their assignment	weekly in arrears. Happy to tailor the approach	BACS	Self billing, invoices by e-mail, implementing an online timesheet system
8	Jobline	Admin & Specialist, All Councils	12.5% of annual salary	8 continuous weeks	8 continuous weeks	invoiced monthly	BACS	Potential developments: on-line timesheets, client self service, on line feedback forms
9	Jobshop	All categories, All Councils	£500 flat fee up to 8 weeks	8 continuous weeks	12 weeks	Weekly - can be tailored	BACS	to be developed: e-timesheets and one monthly invoice with cost centres
10	Penrose	Admin & Ops, All Councils	4%	8 continuous weeks	4 weeks	weekly currently will move to monthly	BACS or direct money transfer	3 copy timesheet, one point of contact

11	Pertemps	All categories, All Councils	office & operational 0-4 weeks 12%, 5-8 weeks 10%, 9-12 weeks 8%, 13-16 weeks 5%, 16 weeks + Free of charge. Specialist - 0-4 weeks 22%, 5-8 weeks 20%, 9-12 weeks 18%, 13-16 weeks 16%, 16 weeks + Free of charge	see timescales in previous column	16 continuous weeks	weekly or monthly, paper or electronic. E-Bill available	BACS	ESS (Electronic Sourcing Solution) Manages CV's etc as well as budget management and integrates with the e-timesheet solution
12	Pro Personnel	Admin & Ops, All Councils	£100 flat rate	10 weeks	1 month	weekly, can support monthly	All payment methods	Monthly invoices while paying staff weekly
13	S. Hams Workforce	S. Hams only, All Categories	10%	10 weeks	10 weeks minus time already worked	Weekly	BACS	Weekly invoice with summary spreadsheets
14	Spring	TDC only, All Categories	8%	12 weeks	8 weeks	Weekly	BACS	My Spring – does e-ordering, e-timesheets, e-invoicing and Management Information
15	Tavistaff	WDBC only, All Categories	10% of the basic annual salary	12 weeks	12 weeks	Weekly	BACS	Standard templates for job orders, tailored invoices, payment reports via e-mail

16	Wise	All categories, All Councils	Up to £18,000 1-4 weeks 12.5% 5-8 weeks 10% 9-13 weeks 5% 14 weeks 0% Over £18,000 - 1-4 weeks 15% 5-8 weeks 12.5% 9-13 weeks 10% 14-18 weeks 5% 19 weeks 0%	£18000 and less 14 weeks, over £18,000 19 weeks	14 weeks from the start of the first assignment	Tailor to the councils requirements	BACS, Pcard or self billing	e-timesheets, e-invoicing, self billing. New clocking in system being implemented, management info access etc
----	------	------------------------------	---	---	---	-------------------------------------	-----------------------------	---

## 2. APPROVAL

Author \_\_\_\_\_ signature (Corporate Procurement Officer)

Approved \_\_\_\_\_ signature (Teignbridge District Council) Role:

Approved \_\_\_\_\_ signature (Teignbridge District Council) Role:

Approved \_\_\_\_\_ signature (South Hams District Council) Role:

Approved \_\_\_\_\_ signature (South Hams District Council) Role:

Approved \_\_\_\_\_ signature (West Devon Borough Council) Role:

Approved \_\_\_\_\_ signature (West Devon Borough Council) Role:

Date: