MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE DEVELOPMENT CONTROL COMMITTEE HELD AT FOLLATON HOUSE, TOTNES, ON WEDNESDAY, 13 FEBRUARY 2008

MEMBERS

* Cllr G J Fielden - Chairman

* Cllr I Longrigg - Vice-Chairman

ø Cllr N A Barnes
ø Cllr H D Bastone
* Cllr J Brazil
* Cllr B F Cane
* Cllr R J Carter
* Cllr S E Cooper
* Cllr P Coulson
ø Cllr J D Hawkins
* Cllr M J Hicks
* Cllr P W Hitchins
* Cllr D W May
ø Cllr D M O'Callaghan
* Cllr J T Pennington
* Cllr R Rowe
* Cllr J W Squire
* Cllr R C Steer
* Cllr R J Vint
* Cllr A Ward
* Cllr J A Westacott

* Denotes attendance

ø Denotes apologies for absence

Officers in attendance:
All Agenda Items: Head of Planning and Building Control, Area Planning Officers (East and West Areas), Solicitor and Senior Member Support Officer.

Also in attendance and participating:
Cllrs P H Cook and S L Rankin

DC.48/07 **MINUTES**

The minutes of the meeting of the Committee held on 16 January 2008 were confirmed as a correct record and signed by the Chairman.

DC.49/07 **CHAIRMAN'S ANNOUNCEMENTS**

Members were informed that following the provisional announcement for dates to determine the Sherford planning application, it was now anticipated that a specially convened meeting of the Committee will be held at 2.00 pm on **Wednesday, 23 April 2008**, with the joint site inspection with Plymouth City Council being held on **Monday, 14 April 2008** at 10.00am on site. Plymouth City Council was anticipating convening a meeting of their Development Control Committee on the afternoon of Thursday, 17 April 2008 in order to also consider the Sherford planning application.

DC.50/07 **DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST**

Members and officers were invited to declare any interests in the items of business to be considered during the course of the meeting. These were recorded as follows:-

Cllr P Coulson declared a prejudicial interest in application number 41/2622/07/F (resubmission of application 41/1781/07/F for alterations and extension to dwelling – Greenhill, Bonaventure Road, Salcombe, TQ8 8BG) by virtue of the applicant being a neighbouring resident and left the meeting during the discussion and vote on this application.

DC.51/07 **PUBLIC PARTICIPATION**

The Chairman announced that the following members of the public had registered their wish to speak at the meeting:-

- 08-19/2525/07/F – Objector – Mr Page – Supporter – Mr Morgan
  Resubmission of 08-19/0110/07/F for the construction and operation of a wind cluster of three wind turbines, approx 1.3MW, up to 100m in height, including construction of substation, access tracks and associated works – Proposed Wind Farm at Beech Tree Farm, North of Goveton, Sandy Lane End, Kingsbridge;

- 56/1968/07/F – Objector – Mr Woods – Supporter – Mr Clemens
  Resubmission of application 56/0754/07/F for erection of 2 no. dwellings – Land rear of 8-14 Collins Road, Sparrow Road, Totnes;

- 15/2492/07/F – Objector – Mr Pullinger – Supporter – Mr Smith
  Resubmission of planning application 15/0455/07/F for demolition of existing buildings and erection of 6 no. flats and associated parking – St Johns Ambulance Association, College Way, Dartmouth, TQ6 9NN;

- 41/2622/07/F – Objector – Mr Axtell – Supporter – Mr Lethbridge
  Resubmission of application 41/1781/07/F for alterations and extension to dwelling – Greenhill, Bonaventure Road, Salcombe, TQ8 8BG;

- 56/2418/07/F – Objector – Ms Ratcliffe – Supporter – Mr Atkins
  Resubmission of application 56/0656/07/F for the erection of a pair of one bedroomed dwellings – Land opp.1 Argyle Terrace and 6 St. Johns Terrace, Totnes;

- 10/2521/07/F – Supporter – Mr Howes
  Erection of building for agricultural use and retrospective permission for polytunnel – Field at SX791388, Garland Vale, South Allington, Kingsbridge;

DC.52/07 **SITE INSPECTIONS**

(a) **Applications deferred at this meeting**

RESOLVED

That a Site Inspection Group comprising the Chairman and four other Members who were present at the meeting be appointed to consider applications deferred at this meeting for that purpose.

DC.53/07 **PLANNING APPLICATIONS**

The Head of Planning and Building Control submitted details of planning applications as indicated in Appendix A to these minutes.

During discussion of these planning applications, the following motions (which were in contradiction to the planning officer recommendations in the published agenda report or were determined by a Chairman's casting vote) were **PROPOSED** and **SECONDED** and on being put to the vote were either **CARRIED** or **LOST**:-

(a) In respect of application 56/1968/07/F (resubmission of application 56/0754/07/F for erection of 2 no. dwellings – Land rear of 8-14 Collins Road, Sparrow Road, Totnes), the following motion was **PROPOSED** and **SECONDED** and on being put to the vote was declared **CARRIED:-**

'That a Site Inspection be held.'

(b) In respect of application 15/2492/07/F (resubmission of planning application 15/0455/07/F for demolition of existing buildings and erection of 6 no. flats and associated parking – St Johns Ambulance Association, College Way, Dartmouth, TQ6 9NN), the following motion was **PROPOSED** and **SECONDED** and on being put to the vote was declared **CARRIED:-**

'That a Site Inspection be held.'

(c) In respect of application 41/2622/07/F (resubmission of application 41/1781/07/F for alterations and extension to dwelling – Greenhill, Bonaventure Road, Salcombe, TQ8 8BG), the following motion was **PROPOSED** and **SECONDED** and on being put to the vote was declared **CARRIED:-**

'That a Site Inspection be held.'

(d) In respect of application 56/2418/07/F (resubmission of application 56/0656/07/F for the erection of a pair of one bedroomed dwellings – Land opp.1 Argyle Terrace and 6 St. Johns Terrace, Totnes), the following motion was **PROPOSED** and **SECONDED** and on being put to the vote was declared **CARRIED:-**

'That a Site Inspection be held.'

RESOLVED

That the planning applications considered at this meeting be determined as indicated in Appendix A to these minutes.

(Meeting commenced at 2.00 pm and concluded at 5.15 pm).

_____
Chairman

APPENDIX A

08_19/2525/07/F

Resubmission of 08_19/0110/07/F for the construction and operation of a wind cluster of three wind turbines, approx. 1.3MW, up to 100m in height, including construction of sub-station, access tracks and associated works – Proposed Wind Farm at Beech Tree Farm, North of Goveton, Sandy Lane End, Kingsbridge – Mrs C Morgan

BUCKLAND-TOUT-SAINTS, EAST ALLINGTON, WOODLEIGH, CHURCHSTOW

Parish Councils' Views – Oppose

Officer Update – late letters of representation raise no new issues: legal update on Counsel's advice on noise issue

Recommendation – Refusal

Committee Decision – Refusal

Reasons for Refusal

1 The proposed development would have an unacceptable impact upon the character, natural beauty and special qualities of the South Devon Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty, the defined Area of Great Landscape Value and the local landscape, contrary to South Hams Local Development Framework Core Strategy Policy CS9, South Hams Local Plan Policy SHDC3 and Devon County Structure Plan Policies CO1, CO3, CO4 & C012.

2 The proposed development, by reason of its height, size and siting, represent an unacceptably overbearing form of development, which would cause harm to the living conditions of the occupiers of 'Pasture Coombe' contrary to the Planning Principles set out in the South Hams Local Plan.

56/1968/07/F

Resubmission of application 56/0754/07/F for erection of 2 no. dwellings – Land rear of 8 to 14 Collins Road, Sparrow Road, Totnes – Mr and Mrs N Clemens

TOTNES

Town Council's Views – Objection, loss of valuable allotment land

Officer Update – recommend S106 Agreement for £4,875 for open space, sport and recreation contribution. DCC confirm no education contribution required.

Recommendation – Conditional Approval

Committee Decision – Site Inspection

15/2492/07/F

Resubmission of planning application 15/0455/07/F for demolition of existing buildings and erection of 6 no. flats and associated parking – St Johns Ambulance Association, College Way, Dartmouth, TQ6 9NN – Hayne Ltd

DARTMOUTH

Town Council's Views – Refusal; visual impact, overdevelopment, unneighbourly and out of keeping with neighbouring properties

Officer Update – None

Recommendation – Conditional Approval; Subject to the prior satisfactory completion of a Section 106 Agreement dealing with a contribution of £20,479 towards the provision of open space, sport and recreation for the benefit of Dartmouth and surrounds, conditional approval.

Committee Decision – Site Inspection

39/2442/07/CU

Retrospective application for change of use of half the building for steel fabrication and industrial storage – Friendship Barn, Rattery, South Brent, TQ10 9LH – Mr C Friend

RATTERY

Parish Council's Views – Objection; unsuitable highway

Officer Update – None

Recommendation – Conditional Approval

Committee Decision – Conditional Approval

Conditions
1 - TIM3 (Standard time limit 3 years)
2 - Non Standard
Restriction of Use (Storage of Steel & Rural Workshop)
3 - Non Standard
External Storage
3 - Non Standard
Hedge Retention
5 – Non Standard
Exclusion of G.D.O (No extensions)

41/2622/07/F

Resubmission of application 41/1781/07/F for alterations and extension to dwelling – Greenhill, Bonaventure Road, Salcombe, TQ8 8BG – Mr & Mrs D Logan

SALCOMBE

Town Council's Views – Views Awaited

Officer Update – letter of representation requesting Committee Site Inspection

Recommendation – Conditional Approval

Committee Decision – Site Inspection

56/2418/07/F

Resubmission of application 56/0656/07/F for the erection of a pair of one bedroomed dwellings – Land opp. 1 Argyle Terrace and 6 St Johns Terrace, Totnes – Mr B J Fereday

TOTNES

Parish Council's Views – Objection; highway safety

Officer Update – recommend contaminated land investigation condition and Section 106 Agreement of £2,925 for open space, sport and recreation contribution. DCC confirm no education contribution required

Recommendation – Conditional Approval

Committee Decision – Conditional Approval

Conditions
1 - TIM3 (Standard three year time limit)
2 - MAT8 (Roofing Natural Slate)
3 - MAT11 (Eaves & Verges)
4 - Non Standard
Brick Sample
5 - MAT23 (Timber, Doors and Windows Reserve)
6 - MAT22 (Joinery Details)
7 - RES30 (Windows)
8 - RES22 (Exclusion of G.D.O.)
9 - Non Standard
Parking
10 - Non Standard
Highways
11 - Non Standard
Noise Assessment

12 – Non Standard
Surface water disposal
13 – Non Standard
Landscaping

10/2521/07/F

Erection of building for agricultural use and retrospective permission for polytunnel – Field at SX91388, Garland Vale, South Allington, Kingsbridge – R Pratt & W Lee

CHIVELSTONE

Parish Council's Views – Objection to the size and height of the agricultural building and the lack of agricultural need

Officer Update – None

Recommendation – Conditional Approval

Committee Decision – Conditional Approval

Conditions
1 - TIM3 (Three year standard time limit)
2 - MAT2 (Samples submitted)
3 – Non Standard
Landscape Plan - Implementation
4 – HGE4 (Hedgerow Retention)
5 - Non Standard
Use of Agricultural Building
6 - Non Standard
Temporary
7 - Non Standard
Use of Polytunnel
8 - Non Standard
Polytunnel
9 – Non Standard
Tidy Site
10 – Exc. Of GPDO
Temporary Buildings and Uses

43/2600/07/F

Resubmission of application 43/1471/07/F for construction of two bedroom dwelling – Jeffreys Meadow, Frogmore, Kingsbridge – Mr C Gibbs

SHERFORD/FROGMORE

Parish Councils' Views – Refusal; should be affordable housing provision. See letter dated 14 January on planning website

Officer Update – None

Recommendation – Conditional Approval

Committee Decision – Conditional Approval

Conditions

1 - TIM3 (Standard three year time limit)
2 - Non Standard
Render Detail
3 - Non Standard
Colour Scheme for Walls
4 - Non Standard
Natural Slate
5 - Non Standard
Fascia Boards
6 - Non Standard
Roofing Details
7 - MAT28 (Flue)
8 - CON8 (Rooflights)
9 - Non Standard
Windows & Doors
10 - Non Standard
Entrance Canopy/Juliet Balcony Details
11 - RES22 (GPDO Exc)
12 - HWY19 (Surface Water)
13 - Non Standard
Hardsurfacing
14 - RES43 (Parking)
15 - HWY14 (Retain Parking)
16 - Non Standard
Landscaping
17 - Non Standard
Retention of Hedgebank

23/2509/07/F

Re-use of former dwelling currently used as a storage barn, as an annexe dwelling ancillary to the main house – Newlands Cottage, Foalesleigh Farm, Harberton, Totnes, TQ9 7SS – Mr A E Chudley

HARBERTON

Parish Council's Views – No objection

Officer Update – None

Recommendation – Refusal

Committee Decision – Refusal

Reasons for Refusal

1 The proposed residential accommodation, which is separate from and independent of the existing house and not intended for a farm worker's accommodation, is in open countryside in an Area of Great Landscape Value where the Local Planning Authority consider that such development would be unsustainable and in conflict with Structure Plan Policies CO1 and CO4; Local Plan Policy SHDC3; Local Plan Review Policies DS4, ENV1, ENV3, HO11 and LDF Core Strategy CS9.

2 The Local Planning Authority consider that the proposed development, to convert the outbuildings to residential accommodation and which involves building new external walls, increasing the height of walls, raising the height of the roof and introducing a hipped roof, would detract from the rural character of the site and its setting in conflict with Structure Plan Policies CO4 and CO6; Local Plan Policies SHDC3, SHDC4 and SHDC15; Local Plan Review Policies DS4, DEV2, ENV3 and HO11; LDF Core Strategy CS7 and CS9.

3 The proposed conversion if occupied on an ancillary basis to the main dwellinghouse results in a residential unit at Foalsleigh Farm too large and expensive for the agricultural needs it presently serves and for the local needs of farm workers in the locality where accommodation needs might be met by the main dwelling in the future. Such development would be contrary to the advice given in Annex A PPS7, South Hams Local Plan Policy SHDC3 and Policies HO9, HO10 of the South Hams Local Plan Review and LDF Core Strategy Policy CS1.