

**MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE DEVELOPMENT CONTROL COMMITTEE
HELD AT FOLLATON HOUSE, TOTNES, ON WEDNESDAY, 30 JULY 2008**

MEMBERS

* Cllr G J Fielden - Chairman

∅ Cllr D W May - Vice-Chairman

∅ Cllr H D Bastone

* Cllr J Brazil

∅ Cllr B F Cane

∅ Cllr R J Carter

* Cllr S E Cooper

* Cllr P Coulson

∅ Cllr J D Hawkins

* Cllr M J Hicks

* Cllr P W Hitchins

∅ Cllr I Longrigg

* Cllr D M O'Callaghan

* Cllr J T Pennington

∅ Cllr R Rowe

* Cllr J W Squire

* Cllr R C Steer

* Cllr R J Vint

* Cllr A Ward

* Cllr J A Westacott

* Denotes attendance

∅ Denotes apologies for absence

Officers in attendance for all agenda items:

Area Planning Officer (Eastern and Western Area), Solicitor and Senior Member
Support Officer.

Also in attendance and participating:

Cllr Barnes

DC.12/08 APPOINTMENT OF VICE-CHAIRMAN

RESOLVED

That Cllr Steer be appointed Vice-Chairman for the duration of
this meeting.

DC.13/08 MINUTES

The minutes of the meeting of the Committee held on 25 June 2008
were confirmed as a correct record and signed by the Chairman.

DC.14/08 CHAIRMAN'S ANNOUNCEMENT

The Chairman was delighted to inform those present that through the
work of the Forward Planning and Development Control Services, the
Council had been granted a Planning Delivery Grant award, which had
been capped at £1,000,000. On behalf of the Committee, the Chairman
extended his congratulations and thanks to those officers and Members
who were involved and supported this achievement.

DC.15/08 DECLARATIONS OF INTEREST

Members and officers were invited to declare any interests in the items of business to be considered during the course of the meeting. These were recorded as follows:-

Cllr Hitchins declared a prejudicial interest in application 04/0420/08/CU (change of use to parking and routine safety maintenance inspections of coach fleet and staff parking – Unit 1, Hursley Business Park, Blackeven Hill, Roborough, Plymouth, PL6 7AD) by virtue of him owning land used to access the site and left the meeting during the debate and vote on this item.

Cllr Pennington declared a personal interest in application 04/0420/08/CU (change of use of parking and routine safety maintenance inspections of coach fleet and staff parking – unit 1, Hursley Business Park, Blackeven Hill, Roborough, Plymouth, PL6 7AD) by virtue of his appointment on Devon County Council's Transport Appeals Group and remained in the meeting and took part in the discussion and vote thereon.

Cllrs Coulson, Fielden, Hicks, Hitchins, Pennington, Squire and Steer declared a personal interest in application number 07/0771/08/F (resubmission of application 07/0140/08/F for the erection of five self-contained residential flats plus associated parking – Development Site adjacent to Venn Farm, Brixton) by virtue of the applicant being a fellow Conservative Group Member of South Hams District Council. All Members remained in the meeting and took part in the vote and debate thereon.

Cllrs Brazil, O'Callaghan, Vint and Ward declared a personal interest in application number 59/0576/08/F (resubmission of application 59/2033/07/F for barn conversion and erection of two new dwellings – Elmfield, West Alvington, Kingsbridge) by virtue of the applicants association with the Liberal Democrat Group. All Members remained in the meeting and took part in the vote and debate thereon.

DC.16/08 PUBLIC PARTICIPATION

The Chairman announced that the following members of the public had registered their wish to speak at the meeting:-

- 37/0503/08/F – Objector; Mr Prosser – Supporter; Mr Bolt
Demolition of existing dwelling and erection of replacement dwelling and garage – The Green House, Bridgend, Newton Ferrers, Plymouth, PL8 1AW;
- 37/0901/08/F – Objector; Mr Carter
Green room/boat/store/shed ancillary to house – Vine Cottage, Riverside Road West, Newton Ferrers, Plymouth, PL8 1AD;

- 37/0998/08/F – Objector; Mr Garland – Supporter; Mr Butler
Alterations and extension to dwelling to include erection of new garage. Conversion of existing garage to music/play room – 16 Perches Close, Membland, Newton Ferrers, Plymouth, PL8 1HZ;
- 33/0662/08/F – Supporter; Mr Yeoman
Demolition of existing bungalow and replacement on same footprint – Plympton Cottage, Malborough, Kingsbridge, TQ7 3DL;
- 41/0983/08/F – Objector; Dr Rowe – Supporter; Mr John
Demolition of dwelling and garage and storage outbuilding and erection of a six bedroom dwelling with separate garage and storage – Brakenwood, DeCourcy Road, Salcombe, TQ8 8LQ.

DC.17/08 **SITE INSPECTIONS**

(a) **Applications deferred at this meeting**

RESOLVED

That a Site Inspection Group comprising the Chairman and four other Members who were present at the meeting be appointed to consider applications deferred at this meeting for that purpose.

(b) **Report of the Site Inspection Group held on 7 July 2008**

- (i) **54/0784/08/F – Resubmission of planning application 54/2033/07/F for construction of new sub room extension and internal alterations – Matthews Point Manor, Strete, Dartmouth, TQ6 0RQ**

Members considered a report of the committee site inspection group in respect of the above planning application, which had included a recommendation that the proposal be conditionally approved. The Area Planning Officer (APO) advised Members that condition 7 of the presented site inspection report should be amended to read 'Stone Work'.

It was then:-

RESOLVED

That in respect of planning application 54/0784/08/F, the application be conditionally approved, with the conditions as per the presented site inspection report, with the exception that condition 7 read: 'stonework'.

(ii) **59/0576/08/F – resubmission of planning application 59/2033/07/F for barn conversion and erection of two new dwellings – Elmfield, West Alvington, Kingsbridge, TQ7 3PP**

Members considered a report of the committee site inspection group in respect of the above planning application, which had included a recommendation that the proposal be conditionally approved. The APO reiterated that Devon County Council Highways had no objection to this proposal. A late letter had been circulated to the Committee from the Parish Council which had suggested extending the entrance onto the site from Vicarage Road along with the idea of making the turn onto the A381 a left hand turn only. In response to this, the APO advised that extending the entrance would reduce the passing areas along Vicarage Road. Furthermore, creating a left hand turn only on to the A381 could possibly increase the dangers with vehicles turning further up the A381.

Members of the Site Inspection Group then proceeded to reiterate that although they had concerns with regard to the access, in light of the Highways Engineer raising no objection to the proposal, they could see no valid planning grounds to refuse it.

It was then:-

RESOLVED

That in respect of application number 59/0576/08/F, the application be conditionally approved, with the conditions as per the presented report.

(iii) **07/0771/08/F – resubmission of application 07/0140/08/F for the erection of five self contained residential flats plus associated car parking – Development Site adjacent to Venn Farm, Brixton, Plymouth**

Members considered a report of the committee site inspection group in respect of the above planning application, which had included a recommendation that the proposal be conditionally approved. The APO advised that the applicant had agreed to relocate the bin storage area, with the original allocated area being landscaped. Furthermore, if Members were minded to approve the application, revised plans for the internal layout of the development had been agreed. The alterations, as suggested in the presented site inspection report, proposed the bathroom to be facing 'Rosemount' with obscure glazing and therefore the bedroom would be located on the elevation facing into the site away from 'Rosemount'.

A local Ward Member, who was present at the site inspection, raised regarding with the area between the development and 'Rosemount' in relation to the use of this land and whether the owners could develop it. In response, the APO drew Members attention to condition 14 'exclude permitted right to erect fencing / decking' (as noted in the presented site inspection report) which would ensure control of the area so no loss of light would be experienced by 'Rosemount'.

It was then:-

RESOLVED

That in respect of application 07/0771/08/F, the application be conditionally approved.

DC.18/08 **PLANNING APPLICATIONS**

The Head of Planning and Building Control submitted details of planning applications as indicated in Appendix A to these minutes.

During discussion of these planning applications, the following motions (which were in contradiction to the planning officer recommendations in the published agenda report or were determined by a Chairman's casting vote) were **PROPOSED** and **SECONDED** and on being put to the vote were either **CARRIED** or **LOST**:-

- (a) In respect of application 37/0503/08F (demolition of existing dwelling and erection of replacement dwelling and garage – The Green House, Bridgend, Newton Ferrers, Plymouth, PL8 1AW) a Member, although not against contemporary designs, expressed concern that this specific design did not complement the surrounding area, especially in light of it being in such a prominent position. Furthermore, a number of Members felt that the materials and design of the proposal were inappropriate to its setting and was in contradiction to the adopted Local Development Framework Core Strategy 7 (Design). In contrast, a Member expressed the opinion that this was a well designed proposal which sat on the same footprint as the current building. Also, it would have a low environmental impact by maximising natural light and insulation. Therefore, the following motion was **PROPOSED** and **SECONDED** but on being put to the vote declared **LOST**:-

RESOLVED

That in respect of application 37/0503/08/F, planning permission be conditionally approved.

Subsequently, the following motion was **PROPOSED** and **SECONDED** but on being put to the vote declared **CARRIED:-**

RESOLVED

That in respect of application 37/0503/08/F, planning permission be refused by virtue of the design being inappropriate to its setting and not being sufficiently compliant with policy CS7.

- (b) In respect of application 37/0998/08/F (alterations and extension to dwelling to include erection of new garage, conversion of existing garage to music / play room – 16 Perches Close, Membland, Newton Ferrers, Plymouth, PL6 7AD) the following motion was **PROPOSED** and **SECONDED** and on being put to the vote was declared **CARRIED:-**

RESOLVED

That in respect of planning application 37/0998/08/F, a site inspection be held.

- (c) In respect of application 33/0662/08/F (demolition of existing bungalow and replacement on same footprint – Plympton Cottage, Marlborough, Kingsbridge, TQ7 3DL) the APO advised that the proposed replacement dwelling, if permitted, would result in a dwelling too large and expensive for the agricultural needs it presently served. The size and design of the roof of the proposed dwelling was such that officers could not satisfactorily prevent the future use of the roofspace as living accommodation. However, in contrast, a local Ward Member felt that this proposal, which would be on the same footprint as the current build, was of satisfactory design and mass. Furthermore, in relation to the agricultural tie it was felt that even with affordable housing provisions, prices were not affordable to agricultural workers and therefore the tie should be removed from any new development on this site. Therefore, the following motion was **PROPOSED** and **SECONDED**, but on being put to the vote declared **LOST:-**

RESOLVED

That in respect of application 33/0662/08/F, planning permission be conditionally approved.

(d) In respect of application 04/0420/08/F (change of use to parking and routine safety maintenance inspections of coach fleet and staff parking – Unit 1, Hursley Business Park, Blackeven Hill, Roborough, Plymouth, PL6 7AD) the following motion was **PROPOSED** and **SECONDED** and on being put to the vote was declared **CARRIED:-**

RESOLVED

That in respect of planning application 04/0420/08/F, a site inspection be held.

RESOLVED

That the planning applications considered at this meeting be determined as indicated in Appendix A to these minutes.

(Meeting commenced at 2.00 pm and concluded at 4.30 pm).

Chairman

APPENDIX A

37/0503/08/F

Demolition of existing dwelling and erection of replacement dwelling and garage – The Green House, Bridgend, Newton Ferrers, Plymouth, PL8 1AW – Mr A Beveridge

NEWTON & NOSS

Parish Council's Views – Objection to the proposal raising the following issues:-

- The proposal does not satisfy LDF planning policies as it will not conserve or enhance the quality, character and local distinctiveness of the natural environment
- The approval of the application will negate the Council's obligations set out in the LDF policies in particular to promote the conservation, enhancement and restoration of local distinctiveness and character
- The scale and massing of the building is wholly out of proportion for the site and surroundings
- Inappropriate use of materials
- Design is unsympathetic and not in character with the area
- Inappropriate development for the Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty

Officer Update – None

Recommendation – Conditional Approval

Committee Decision – Refused

Reasons for Refusal:

- 1 The proposed development by reason of its scale and contemporary design is considered to be wholly inappropriate to its contextual setting and character and appearance of the area. Such development would have an unacceptable visual impact and so be contrary to the objectives of Devon County Structure Plan Policies C03, C06; South Hams Local Plan Policies SHDC1, SHDC15 and Policies CS7 & CS9 of the South Hams LDF Core Strategy.

37/0901/08/F

Garden room/boat store/shed ancillary to house – Vine Cottage, Riverside Road West, Newton Ferrers, Plymouth, PL8 1AD – Mr & Mrs M James

NEWTON & NOSS

Parish Council's Views – The proposal will be inappropriate in the Conservation Area and interfere with views of the river from the road. The comments can be viewed on the Council's website.

Officer Update – None

Recommendation – Conditional Approval

Committee Decision – Conditional Approval

Conditions

- 1 - TIM3 (Three year standard time limit)
 - 2 - MAT23
(Timber, Doors & Windows Reserve Details Vents)
 - 3 - MAT30
(Full Details – Ducts, Flues, Vents, Etc)
 - 4 - Non Standard
(Details of Finish and Colour of Timber Cladding)
 - 5 - USE3 (Ancillary Use)
-

37/0998/08/F

Alterations and extension to dwelling to include erection of new garage. Conversion of existing garage to music/play room – 16 Perches Close, Membland, Newton Ferrers, Plymouth, PL8 1HZ – Mr Dowers

NEWTON & NOSS

Parish Council's Views – The Parish Council has objected to the proposed development on the grounds that the mass of the garage would be too imposing and would have an unacceptable impact on the neighbouring property no. 15. Concerns were also raised in respect of the existing boundary wall. The letter can be viewed on the Council's website.

Officer Update – None

Recommendation – Conditional Approval

Committee Decision – Site Inspection

33/0662/08/F

Demolition of existing bungalow and replacement on same footprint – Plympton Cottage, Malborough, Kingsbridge, TQ7 3DL – Mrs G M J Meyer

MALBOROUGH

Parish Council's Views – Support. As a Council we find it mystifying when other new farmhouses in the Parish are allowed to be built on a much larger scale with rooms in the roof which were allowed by retrospective planning. It would appear then unfair for a smaller well designed property to be discriminated against partially due to the fact that it is on a smaller farm.

Officer Update – None

Recommendation – Refusal

Committee Decision – Refused

Reasons for Refusal:

1. The proposed replacement dwelling, if permitted, would result in a dwelling too large and expensive for the agricultural needs it presently serves and for the local needs of farm workers in the locality where accommodation needs might be met by the dwelling in the future. Such development would be contrary to the advice given in annex A PPS7 and South Hams Local Plan Policy SHDC3.
 2. The size and design of the roof of the proposed dwelling is such that the Local Planning Authority could not satisfactorily prevent the future use of the roofspace as living accommodation. The proposed development in combination with the conversion of the roofspace into living accommodation would result in a dwelling too large and expensive for the agricultural needs it presently serves and for the local needs of farm workers in the locality where accommodation needs might be met by the dwelling in the future. Such development would be contrary to the advice given in annex A PPS7 and South Hams Local Plan Policy SHDC3.
-

04/0420/08/CU

Change of use to parking and routine safety maintenance inspections of coach fleet and staff parking – Unit 1, Hursley Business Park, Blackeven Hill, Roborough, Plymouth, PL6 7AD – Mr Ford

BICKLEIGH

Parish Council's Views – Objection

Officer Update – None

Recommendation – Conditional Approval

Committee Decision – Site Inspection

51/1118/08/F

Re-submission of planning application 51/2548/07/F for alterations and minor amendments to 51/0975/07/F for new dwelling in place of existing bungalow – Frenchmans Creek, New Road, Stoke Fleming, Dartmouth, TQ6 0PH – Mr Ashford

STOKE FLEMING

Parish Council's Views – No objection

Officer Update – None

Recommendation – Conditional Approval

Committee Decision – Conditional Approval

Conditions

- 1 - TIM3 (Standard 3 year time limit)
- 2 – MAT8 (Natural Slate)
- 3 - MAT12 (Eaves & Verges)
- 4 - MAT14 (Walls Render)
- 5 - MAT16 (Local Stone)
- 6 - MAT22 (Joimery Details)
- 7 - MAT30 (Full Details)
- 8 - RES43 (Parking)
- 9 - HWY19 (Surface Water)
- 10 - Non Standard
- Landscaping & Maintenance
- 11 - Non Standard
- Landscape Inspection
- 12 - Non Standard
- Contaminated Land Survey
- 13 - Non Standard
- Contaminated Land Report
- 14 - Non Standard
- Contaminated Remediation Strategy
- 15 - RES22 (GDO Exc)
- 16 - Non Standard
- Incidental Use
- 17 - Non Standard
- Retention of Stone Boundary Walls
- 18 - Non Standard
- Timing of Works (Cirl Buntings)
- 19 – MIS4 (Alternative Permission)

41/0983/08/F

Demolition of dwelling and garage and storage outbuilding and erection of six bedroom dwelling with separate garage and storage – Brackenwood, De Courcy Road, Salcombe, TQ8 8LQ – Mr Cameron

SALCOMBE

Town Council's Views – If approved this development would be visible for generations of walkers using the coast path. Councillors disagreed with the architect's comments that such development will match or blend with the area noting that others in the South Sands area have been more sympathetic. The use of the flat roof is perceived to only be favoured to maximise the full capacity of space available and does not blend and sit well. This development is an additional 82% increase on the original property. The glass central atrium to the sea view will adversely impact upon the Area of Outstanding Natural Beauty and Coastal Preservation Area. The environmental elements referred to in the additional text are only a personal consideration and justification for such development considering the

design, bulk, mass and impact on the Salcombe area, which will be visually adverse and cause further light pollution of the area (CS7, SHDC15).

Officer Update – None

Recommendation – Conditional Approval

Committee Decision – Conditional Approval

Conditions

1 – TIM3 (Standard three year time limit)

2 – MAT 16 (Local Stone)

3 – RES22 (Exc. Of GDO)

4 – RES42 (Parking)

5 – Non Standard

Contamination

6 – Non Standard

Remediation Works
